### **COPYRIGHT<sup>©</sup> 2019 EDIZIONI MINERVA MEDICA**

© 2018 EDIZIONI MINERVA MEDICA Online version at http://www.minervamedica.it The Journal of Sports Medicine and Physical Fitness 2019 March;59(3):520-3 DOI: 10.23736/S0022-4707.18.09146-6

REVIEW

EPIDEMIOLOGY AND CLINICAL MEDICINE

### Spectator injuries in sports

Connor READ, Christopher BEAUMONT, Jonathan ISBELL, Alex DOMBROWSKY, Eugene BRABSTON, Brent PONCE, Heath HALE, Kennieth MCCOLLOUGH, Reed ESTES, Amit M. MOMAYA \*

UAB Sports Medicine, Department of Orthopedic Surgery, University of Alabama at Birmingham, Birmingham, AL, USA

\*Corresponding author: Amit M. Momaya, Department of Orthopedic Surgery, University of Alabama at Birmingham, 1313 13th St S, Birmingham, AL 35205, USA. E-mail: amit.momaya@gmail.com

#### ABSTRACT

INTRODUCTION: Injury documentation and prevention has largely focused on the athletes participating in the sporting event. However, spectators are at risk for injury as well depending on the sport and venue. No study to date has recorded and analyzed spectator injuries in sports. The purpose of this study was to document spectator injuries across different sports.

EVIDENCE ACQUISITION: Scholarly articles and internet search engines were used to generate a list of spectator injuries across a variety of sports. Information gathered regarding each specific spectator injury included sport type, injury type, and injury mechanism. EVIDENCE SYNTHESIS: A total of 181 spectator injuries were collected. The sport with the most spectator injuries found was automobile/motorcycle racing (N.=123), followed by cycling (N.=25), cricket (N.=12), baseball (N.=10), and hockey (N.=8). The majority of spectator injuries were related to the sport and not the behavior of the surrounding spectators. Among documented injuries sustained by spectators, automobile/motorcycle racing had the greatest number of mortalities (N.=38), followed by cycling (N.=17), hockey (N.=4), baseball (N.=2), and cricket (N.=1). CONCLUSIONS: Although uncommon, spectators at sporting events are at risk for injury. Some of these injuries are serious and even fatal. Future work needs to focus on implementing safety measures to protect spectators while still allowing them to enjoy live sporting events.

(*Cite this article as:* Read C, Beaumont C, Isbell J, Dombrowsky A, Brabston E, Ponce B, *et al.* Spectator injuries in sports. J Sports Med Phys Fitness 2019;59:520-3. DOI: 10.23736/S0022-4707.18.09146-6)

KEY WORDS: Sports medicine - Wounds and injuries - Safety.

#### Introduction

S ignificant research has been performed on injuries sustained by athletes during sporting events.<sup>1-6</sup> Due to their high level of activity, athletes routinely subject their bodies to significant stresses during play and are at higher risk for sustaining musculoskeletal injuries when compared to the general population. There have been many recent rule changes during sporting events to help deter actions that may pose a greater injury risk to athletes.<sup>7-9</sup>

In contrast, little attention has been given to the risks that spectators face when viewing live sporting events. Spectators often come to sporting events as a form of entertainment without fear of injury. However, spectators can become injured during sporting events, sometimes even fatally. To date, no study has comprehensively documented injuries sustained by spectators. The purpose of this study was to document spectator injuries across various sports. Furthermore, we sought to identify any trends and potential areas where safety measures could be implemented to protect spectators.

#### **Evidence acquisition**

Scholarly databases (Pubmed and Embase) and an online search engine (www.google.com) were utilized to document publicized spectator injuries across a variety of sports. Keywords used in these online searches included "spectator injuries," "spectators injured at sports," and "spectator fatalities." Three health professionals conducted the searches independently.

Data regarding each specific spectator injury was documented. Video, when available, was also viewed to confirm details regarding the injury. Recorded data included SPECTATOR INJURIES IN SPORTS

the type of sporting event, the mechanism by which the injury occurred, type of injury, setting in which the injury occurred, and whether the injury was fatal. Any discrepancy in data between the independent searches were reviewed by all health professionals to arrive at consensus decision.

### **Evidence synthesis**

The searches produced a total of 181 publicly documented spectator injuries. The sporting events involved included cycling, automobile and motorcycle racing, hockey, and baseball, and cricket.

The sport with the greatest number of documented spectator injuries was automobile and motorcycle racing (N.=123). Automobile and motorcycle racing included National Association for Stock Car Auto Racing (NASCAR), Dakar Rally racing series, Baja racing, motocross, Isle of Man motorcycle racing series, Mount Olivers racing series, and Championship Auto Racing Teams (CART) series racing. Among documented injuries sustained by spectators, automobile/motorcycle racing had the greatest number of mortalities (N.=38), followed by cycling (N.=17), hockey (N.=4), baseball (N.=2), and cricket (N.=1). Table I provides a summary of the findings.<sup>10-34</sup> Supplementary Digital Material 1 (Supplementary Table I) is a detailed list of the spectator injuries organized by sport.

#### Discussion

This is the first study to document spectator injuries across various sports. Spectator injuries do occur and can sometimes be fatal.

The sporting event in which the greatest number of spectator injuries was documented was motor vehicle racing. One mechanism by which injury was associated with racing sports involved incidents where athletes wrecked vehicles into the crowd. Predicting a potential crash is very difficult. However, event planners should take measures to help protect spectators without compromising the viewing experience of the spectator during the event. For motor vehicle racing, such measures may entail constructing a greater number of impenetrable clear barriers that prevent the vehicle from entering the spectator area. Furthermore, some of the injuries were the result of debris entering the spectator area. Thus, it is important to make the barriers impermeable to debris in order to protect spectators.

READ

In similar fashion, expanding the netting in baseball may help protect spectators. There were six cases of a spectator sustaining an injury after being struck by foul ball, with one of these incidents being fatal. In fact, just recently, all 30 Major League Baseball team have agreed to extend the protective netting to the far ends of both dugouts.35 However, this still leaves several fans seated just beyond the dugouts in danger of being struck by high speed foul balls. The same concept could be translated to hockey, where larger barriers may have prevented high speed pucks from reaching spectators. Such expansion of barriers will promote the safety of the spectators without significant compromise to the viewing experience. Furthermore, there were seven cases of a cricket spectators being hit by a "six" that entered the stands, with one of those being fatal. Cricket venues tend to lack protective netting and barriers, which places spectators at increased risk of injury from balls hit into the audience. Cricket venues should follow the changes implemented by Major League Baseball with extended netting to protect spectators from injuries with high speed balls.

While the nature of the sport itself may expose spectators to increased risk, that is not the only cause of injury at these events. In fact, the majority of injuries that occurred at cycling events were not related to cycling itself. Five spectators were injured by a publicity caravan, three were injured by a security guard motorcycle, and twelve were injured after being struck by a tanker truck. Similarly, at motor vehicle racing events there were incidents in which support staff wrecked vehicles into the crowd. This finding suggests that factors such as crowd control, event planning, and staff training also play important roles in specta-

TABLE I.—Injuries among spectators at various sporting events.

Sport	Number of events (N.)	Injury due to sport N. (%)	Injury due to crowd behavior N. (%)	Fatalities** N. (%)
Cycling <sup>10-17</sup>	25	10 (40%)	21 (84%)	17 (68%)
Auto/motorcycle racing <sup>18-25</sup>	123	102 (83%)	1 (1%)	38 (31%)
Hockey <sup>26</sup>	8	8 (100%)	0 (0%)	4 (50%)
Baseball <sup>27, 28</sup>	10	8 (80%)	5 (50%)	2 (20%)
Cricket <sup>29-34</sup>	12	8 (67%)	4 (33%)	1 (8%)

\*Values for injury due to sport and injury due to crowd behavior do not add to 100% because some injuries were due to both; \*\*this only represents fatalities in injuries at sporting events that have been reported; the overall incidence of spectator fatalities at sporting events is extremely low

**This** Ŀ

## **COPYRIGHT<sup>©</sup> 2019 EDIZIONI MINERVA MEDICA**

READ

tor safety. In addition to protecting spectators from injury due to the sport, attention should be given to all components of the event to ensure that sports fans can safely enjoy their experience.

An important point to note is the fact that the overall incidence of serious spectator injuries remains low. The risk exposure is large, vet there are not a large number of publicized spectator injuries. A study of medical clinic utilization in the alpine environment of the winter Olympics found that 1103 of 410,160 (roughly 0.3%) spectators utilized on-site care, and only 50 of 410,160 (0.01%) spectators required further interventions or care at an official medical facility.<sup>36</sup> A study completed pertaining to spectator utilization of medical care at baseball games found that 247 of 1,582,000 spectators utilized healthcare stations during the 2003 baseball season.<sup>37</sup> It is unclear whether utilization of on-site care was even related to the sporting event though. Nonetheless, given that some of these spectator injuries can be serious and even fatal, spectators should maintain increased awareness during game play to potentially avoid serious injuries.

Unfortunately, there is no central database for recording the occurrence of injuries to spectators during sporting events. This makes it difficult to monitor and assess if the rates of injuries are increasing or decreasing and if protective measures taken by sporting organizations are efficacious. Such a database would provide much insight into the risk spectators face, but the challenges in creating one are several. Coordination of multiple governing bodies across multiple countries would be required. Additionally, a threshold of what is considered an injury would have to be agreed upon.

#### Limitations of the study

This study is not without limitations. Foremost, this study is a retrospective study. Second, the data obtained in the study is largely from web-based searches. There may be several spectator injuries that were missed due to the lack of publicity. However, there currently is no database to capture spectator injuries. Third, among the documented spectator injuries there was bias towards fatal injuries. Such injuries are much more likely to draw publicity and thus be captured via our searches when compared to minor injuries.

#### Conclusions

There are risks spectators assume when attending live sporting events. Though the risk is likely minimal, spectators can incur serious injuries and some of these may be fatal. Further research is needed to document the epidemiology of such injuries and implement safety measures to keep spectators safe during sporting events.

#### References

1. Goodman AD, DeFroda SF, Gil JA, Kleiner JE, Li NY, Owens BD. Season-Ending Shoulder Injuries in the National Collegiate Athletic Association: Data From the NCAA Injury Surveillance Program, 2009-2010 Through 2013-2014. Am J Sports Med 2018;46:1936–42.

**2.** Kerbel YE, Smith CM, Prodromo JP, Nzeogu MI, Mulcahey MK. Epidemiology of Hip and Groin Injuries in Collegiate Athletes in the United States. Orthop J Sports Med 2018;6:2325967118771676.

**3.** LaBella CR, Mjaanes J; Council on Sports Medicine and Fitness. Cheerleading injuries: epidemiology and recommendations for prevention. Pediatrics 2012;130:966–71.

**4.** Meron A, Saint-Phard D. Track and Field Throwing Sports: injuries and Prevention. Curr Sports Med Rep 2017;16:391–6.

**5.** Momaya A, Read C, Estes R. When celebrations go wrong: a case series of injuries after celebrating in sports. J Sports Med Phys Fitness 2017;57:267–71.

**6.** Nabhan D, Walden T, Street J, Linden H, Moreau B. Sports injury and illness epidemiology during the 2014 Youth Olympic Games: United States Olympic Team Surveillance. Br J Sports Med 2016;50:688–93.

**7.** Emery CA, Black AM, Kolstad A, Martinez G, Nettel-Aguirre A, Engebretsen L, *et al.* What strategies can be used to effectively reduce the risk of concussion in sport? A systematic review. Br J Sports Med 2017;51:978–84.

**8.** Krill MK, Borchers JR, Hoffman JT, Krill ML, Hewett TE. Analysis of Football Injuries by Position Group in Division I College Football: A 5-Year Program Review. Clin J Sport Med 2018.

**9.** Westermann RW, Kerr ZY, Wehr P, Amendola A. Increasing Lower Extremity Injury Rates Across the 2009-2010 to 2014-2015 Seasons of National Collegiate Athletic Association Football: An Unintended Consequence of the "Targeting" Rule Used to Prevent Concussions? Am J Sports Med 2016;44:3230–6.

**10.** Benson D. Tour de France: Spectator accidentally caused inflatable banner to collapse. Cycling News; 2016 [Internet]. Available from: http://www.cyclingnews.com/news/tour-de-france-spectator-accidentally-caused-inflatable-banner-to-collapse/ [cited 2018, Oct 23].

**11.** Clarke S. Young spectator hit by vehicle on Tour de France stage three. Cycling Weekly; 2016 [Internet]. Available from: https://www. cyclingweekly.com/news/racing/tour-de-france/young-spectator-hit-vehicle-tour-de-france-stage-three-252777 [cited 2018, Oct 23].

**12.** Dator J. Tour de France spectator gets hit in the face with cyclist's leftover food. Lookit; 2017 [Internet]. Available from: https://www.sbnation.com/lookit/2017/7/3/15914180/tour-de-france-spectator-hit-in-the-face-leftover-food [cited 2018, Oct 23].

**13.** Fotheringham W. Spectator in coma after Tour rider collision. The Guradian; 2017.

**14.** Llp AC. Four Cyclists Have Died in the Tour de France; 2012; [Internet]. Available from: visual.ly/community/infographic/sports/four-cyclists-have-died-tour-de-france [cited 2018, Oct 23].

**15.** Spectator suffers leg injuries after Tour de France sponsor's vehicle; 2012 [Internet]. Available from: https://www.huffingtonpost. ca/2012/07/03/spectator-suffers-broken-\_n\_1646066.html [cited 2018, Oct 23].

**16.** Reporter D. Female spectator killed in crash with police motorcycle during Tour de France. Daily Mail; 2009 [Internet]. Available from: https://www.dailymail.co.uk/news/article-1200534/Female-spectator-

# **COPYRIGHT<sup>©</sup> 2019 EDIZIONI MINERVA MEDICA**

SPECTATOR INJURIES IN SPORTS

killed-crash-police-motorcycle-Tour-France.html [cited 2018, Oct 23]. **17.** Schwartz N. Watch a Tour de France rider plow through a spectator standing on the road. USA Today; 2014 [Internet]. Available from: https:// ftw.usatoday.com/2014/07/tour-de-france-spectator-crash [cited 2018, Oct 23].

**18.** Collins A. Three Deaths Confirmed at 2016 Baja 500 Including 8-Year-Old Spectator. Express; 2017 [Internet]. Available from: https://jalopnik.com/three-deaths-confirmed-at-2016-baja-500-include-8-year-1780670922 [cited 2018, Oct 23].

**19.** Contributors W. Wikipedia, The Free Encyclopedia; 2018 [Internet]. Available from: https://en.wikipedia.org/w/index.php?title=List\_of\_Da-kar\_Rally\_fatal\_accidents&oldid=857854280 [cited 2018, Oct 23].

**20.** George P. When Spectators Pay The Price For The Dangers Of Auto Racing; 2013 [Internet]. Available from: https://jalopnik.com/when-spectators-pay-the-price-for-the-dangers-of-auto-r-416344575 [cited 2018, Oct 23].

**21.** James B. Justin Allgaier's crew chief among those injured in sprint car crash. USA Today; 2017 [Internet]. Available from: https://eu.usatoday. com/story/sports/motor/2017/02/19/spectators-injured-sprint-car-crash-volusia-speedway-park/98144238/ [cited 2018, Oct 23].

**22.** Pleasance C. Spectator dies at Nurburgring after British racing driver Jann Mardenborough's car flips into air and crashes into crowd. Daily Mail; 2015 [Internet]. Available from: https://www.dailymail.co.uk/news/article-3016244/Spectator-dies-Nurburgring-British-racing-driver-Jann-Mardenborough-s-car-flips-air-crashes-crowd.html [cited 2018, Oct 23].

**23.** Staff HC. Three race fans killed at Michigan Motor Speedway. This Day In History: A+E Networks; 2009 [Internet]. Available from: https://www.history.com/this-day-in-history/three-race-fans-killed-at-michigan-speedway [cited 2018, Oct 23].

**24.** Staff S. Isle of Man TT Race Crash: 10 Spectators Hurt; 2013 [Internet]. Available from: https://news.sky.com/story/isle-of-man-tt-race-crash-10-spectators-hurt-10443623 [cited 2018, Oct 23].

**25.** Staff VN. 70-Year-Old Spectator Injured In Skerries 100. Visor Down; 2008 [Internet]. Available from: https://www.irishtimes.com/news/spectator-seriously-injured-in-bike-race-crash-1.825442 [cited 2018, Oct 23].

**26.** Myles WM, Dickinson JD, LaRoche GR. Ice hockey and spectators' eye injuries. N Engl J Med 1993;329:364.

27. Chu GK, Johnston KM. Baseball: spectator or contact sport? Clin J Sport Med 2000;10:204–5.

28. Cloutier C. How often are baseball spectoators injured during game

play? Boston Globe; 2015 Available from: https://www.bostonglobe.com/ metro/2015/06/09/how-often-are-baseball-spectators-injured/bVBG1iYz8u0dy1DLGx0cml/story.html [cited 2018, Oct 23].

**29.** Banerjee A. Spectators on the recieving end of a batsman's fury. Cricket Country; 2015 [Internet]. Available from: https://www.cricket-country.com/articles/spectators-on-the-receiving-end-of-a-batsmans-fury-288085 [cited 2018, Oct 23].

**30.** Gammell C. Cricket teams face legal bill after mother hit on head with ball. The Telegraph; 2009 [Internet]. Available from: https://www.telegraph.co.uk/sport/cricket/4269880/Cricket-teams-face-legal-bill-after-mother-hit-on-head-with-ball.html [cited 2018, Oct 23].

**31.** Hirst A. Spectator badly hurt at Upper Hopton chasing cricket ball. The Huddersfield Daily Examiner; 2016 [Internet]. Available from: https://www.examinerlive.co.uk/news/west-yorkshire-news/spectator-badly-hurt-upper-hopton-11334485 [cited 2018, Oct 23].

**32.** Liew J. Three spectators injred after section of stand caves in during t20 between England and West Indies at Durham. The Telegraph; 2017 [Internet]. Available from: https://www.telegraph.co.uk/cricket/2017/09/16/three-spectators-injured-section-stand-caves-t20-england-west/ [cited 2018, Oct 23].

**33.** Menczel A. Cricket Unfiltered: Flying cricket balls puts crowd in danger. The Daily Telegraph; 2017 [Internet]. Available from: https://www.news.com.au/sport/cricket/cricket-unfiltered-flying-cricket-balls-puts-crowd-in-danger/news-story/10f3c5221aa7e713afc3ce8efe14cb52 [cited 2018, Oct 23].

**34.** Staff C. IPL 2015: David Miller Injures Kolkata Police Constable in the eye durring KKR-KXIP match. Cricket Country; 2009 [Internet]. Available from: https://www.cricketcountry.com/news/ipl-2015-davidmiller-injures-kolkata-police-constable-in-the-eye-during-kkr-kxipmatch-287023 [cited 2018, Oct 23].

**35.** Schad T. All 30 MLB Teams will extend protective netting this season. USA Today; 2018 [Internet]. Available from: https://eu.usatoday. com/story/sports/mlb/injuries/2018/02/01/mlb-teams-extend-protective-netting-season/1086019001/ [cited 2018, Oct 23].

**36.** Allen TL, Jolley SJ, Cooley VJ, Winn RT, Harrison JD, Price RR, *et al.* The epidemiology of illness and injury at the alpine venues during the Salt Lake City 2002 Winter Olympic Games. J Emerg Med 2006;30:197–202.

**37.** Ishikawa H, Hori S, Aikawa N. The incidence of sickness/trauma in spectators of professional baseball at the Meiji Jingu Baseball Stadium. Keio J Med 2007;56:85–91.

*Conflicts of interest.*—The authors certify that there is no conflict of interest with any financial organization regarding the material discussed in the manuscript. *Authors' contributions.*—Connor Read, Christopher Beaumont, Jonathan Isbell, Eugene Brabston, Brent Ponce, Heath Hale, Kennieth Mccollough, Reed Estes, Amit Momaya were involved in study conception and design, interpretation of data, drafting and revising the article, and approval of the final draft; Alex Dombrowsky was primarily responsible for preparation and editing of the manuscript.

Article first published online: October 31, 2018. - Manuscript accepted: October 9, 2018. - Manuscript revised: September 26, 2018. - Manuscript received: July 11, 2018.

For supplementary materials, please see the HTML version of this article at www.minervamedica.it